



"Anthropologists! Anthropologists!"

## body paint, feathers, and vcrs: aesthetics and authenticity in Amazonian activism

BETH A. CONKLIN—Vanderbilt University

Every connoisseur of anthropology department bulletin boards knows this *Far Side* cartoon (Larson 1984): A grass-skirted native man in a tall headdress stands at the window of a thatched hut. He has just spotted a couple of pith-helmeted, camera-toting creatures coming ashore and sounds the alarm: "Anthropologists! Anthropologists!" His two companions, similarly attired with bones through their noses, rush to unplug their television, VCR, lamp, and telephone and stash them out of sight. The cartoon captures a persistent stereotype about native peoples and cultural authenticity. The first, obvious idea is that outsiders (anthropologists included) tend to see complex Western technology as a corrupting force that undermines traditional cultures. "Real" natives don't use VCRs.

A second, more subtle message in Gary Larson's sketch concerns the importance of exotic body images in defining cultural integrity. Hide the television, but keep the grass skirt, and the "authenticity" of the natives goes unquestioned.

Authenticity has its rewards. In Larson's modernist model of colonial encounters, grass-skirted natives may claim the attention of visiting anthropologists and any concomitant benefits of prestige or payment. In contemporary indigenous identity politics, exotic body images carry a similar strategic weight in asserting symbolic claims to authenticity.

In this article I explore relations among the trilogy of elements highlighted above: indigenous body images, high technology, and Western notions of cultural authenticity. My purpose is to offer a reflection on the centrality of body images in defining indigenous authenticity for Western audiences, and to raise questions about the political implications of replicating these symbolic constructs in pro-indigenous activism and advocacy. I focus on interethnic politics in Brazil, where native costume took on new meanings in the 1980s as the rise of environmentalism and the spread of new modes of communication created transnational audiences and support networks engaged with Amazonian Indian causes.

The recent transformation of native Amazonian activism is a case study in how local-global interactions and encounters with the social conditions of postmodernity—especially accelerated

---

*In this article I seek to motivate critical reflection on the centrality of exotic body images in defining cultural authenticity for Western audiences and to raise questions about the political implications of replicating these constructs in indigenous identity politics. Focusing on Amazonian Indian activism in Brazil, I examine how the rise of environmentalism and the spread of new communications technologies in the 1980s transformed Amazonian interethnic politics and the self-representations of native activists. Indigenous images constructed in relation to Western concepts of primitivism, exoticism, and authenticity proved to be strategically effective political tools, but there are contradictions and liabilities in using such symbolic constructs to pursue indigenous goals of self-determination. [symbolic politics, body images, environmentalism, technology, Amazonian Indians]*

---

American Ethnologist 24(4):711-737. Copyright © 1997, American Anthropological Association.

flows of information, images, technologies, and people across social and geographic boundaries—shape cultural imaginations and cultural politics (see Appadurai 1990; Knauft 1994:120). In the past decade, the surge of public concern about threats to the tropical rain forest catapulted Brazilian Indians into the limelight of global media attention. Certain individuals from remote Amazonian communities found themselves deluged with invitations to travel abroad, speak at ecology conferences, meet world leaders, accompany rock stars on concert tours, and testify before policy makers at the World Bank, the United Nations, the United States Congress, and the European Union headquarters. As Indian activists journeyed into these arenas of intercultural dialogue, they encountered Western value systems and technologies of representation that offered new perspectives on their own cultures and new channels for communicating their concerns to influential outsiders. Responding to these possibilities, Indian activists transfigured the ways in which they presented themselves and their cultures to the world.

Native Amazonians who once took pains to hide external signs of indigenous identity behind mass-produced Western clothing now proclaim their cultural distinctiveness with headdresses, body paint, beads, and feathers. Many anthropologists have interpreted this revival of native costume as an expression of political assertiveness and renewed pride in being Indian (Turner 1992b:299). It certainly is. It is equally clear that this shift responds not only to indigenous values and internal societal dynamics, but also to foreign ideas, aesthetics, and expectations about Indians. As some native South Americans have learned to speak the language of Western environmentalism and reframe their cosmological and ecological systems in terms of Western concepts like “respect for Mother Earth,” “being close to nature,” and “protecting biosphere diversity,” so some also have learned to use Western visual codes to position themselves politically.<sup>1</sup>

In assessing the role of symbols of Indian identity in Amazonian eco-politics, I develop two major points. First, I show how ideological, technological, and political developments of the 1980s and 1990s influenced the construction of the public (body) images of native activists. Second, I argue that, along with the political and cultural benefits, there are potential contradictions and problems, for Indians, with using these strategic representations (and the kind of identity politics with which they are associated) to pursue indigenous goals of self-determination.

I take as my starting point the idea that Western notions of cultural identity privilege exotic body images as an index of authenticity. I then contrast this with the pressures to downplay exoticism and adopt Western clothing that most Amazonian Indians experience in interethnic encounters at the local level. To illustrate several different situations and indigenous responses, I draw examples from my field research with the Wari’ (Pakaa Nova) of western Brazil (Rondônia), and from studies of the Kayapó of central Brazil, the Nambiquara of west-central Brazil, and the Awá of eastern Ecuador. In my analysis I trace how the revival of native body decorations in some groups developed in the context of two major trends: the spread of new technologies and infrastructure to formerly isolated areas of the Amazon basin, and the internationalization of local Indian rights struggles through the linkage to environmentalism. I show that the nature of contemporary eco-politics—especially its dependence on global media—intensifies pressures for Indian activists to conform to certain images. Exploring the visual semiotics of activist body images illuminates how selective aesthetic emphases reflect the symbolic values that environmentalists and others identify with authentic Indianness. In the final section of this article, I discuss recent events suggesting that this political commodification of indigenous images may ultimately work against Brazilian Indian interests.

Indigenous body images constitute a form of “representing culture” (Myers 1991) that is both a dimension of the self-production of Amazonian activists and a channel through which they communicate with non-Indian audiences. In this article, my intent is not to focus on the meanings that native activists themselves attach to these images. Rather, I am concerned with exploring the political consequences for Indians of relying on political strategies whose efficacy

depends on representing indigenous actors and their causes in terms that conform to outsiders' stereotypes of Indianness. Western images of Indians are the product of Western discourses. These images often say more about Westerners than about Indians and tend toward simplistic notions that do not encompass the complex realities of most native peoples' lives. As an ethnographer who works with a relatively "unpoliticized" Brazilian Indian population that remains largely outside the discourses of eco-activism, national party politics, and pan-Indian organizing, I am especially concerned with how the objectification of culture in ethnic representations affects those native peoples who neither produce nor conform to them.

Visual symbols are at the heart of this story because the politics of the Indian-environmentalist alliance is primarily a symbolic politics. Images and ideas, not common identity or mutual economic interests, mobilize political cooperation among people separated by wide distances and differences of language, culture, and historical experience. Symbols are important in all politics, but they are central in native Amazonian activism; in the absence of electoral clout or (in most cases) economic influence, the "symbolic capital" (Bourdieu 1977) of cultural identity is one of Brazilian Indians' most important political resources.

As native Brazilian activists entered the global public arena, *visual* images—especially body images—emerged as a privileged sphere for negotiating representations of Indian identity. Visual imagery is especially critical because language barriers impede communication with foreign journalists, most of whom do not speak Portuguese. Pictures, however, speak volumes in the competition for media attention. Those activists—both Indians and non-Indians—who wield positive symbols of indigenous identity achieve a "profit of distinction" (Bourdieu 1984), which offers strategic advantages in media-sensitive transnational politics.

As cultural productions, indigenous body representations, while created from Amazonian cultural elements, have constructed—to borrow a phrase from Fred Myers (1991:35)—a *permissible* image that identifies native elements with Western concepts and thereby wins the approval of outsiders. In Amazonian eco-politics, both Indian and non-Indian spokespersons have come to promote an idealized image that Kent Redford (1990) dubbed the "Ecologically Noble Savage." Amazonian Indians are represented as guardians of the forest, natural conservationists whose cultural traditions and spiritual values predispose them to live in harmony with the earth. Laura Graham and I have discussed problems with assuming that native Amazonian attitudes toward nature and priorities for managing ecological resources can be equated directly with Western environmentalist principles (Conklin and Graham 1995).<sup>2</sup> Here, the point I wish to emphasize is that generic stereotypes of Indians, no matter how sympathetic, can become liabilities. The current popular appreciation for the ecological wisdom of native peoples has an undeniable basis in Amazonian cultural ecology and ethnobiology.<sup>3</sup> But in moving into the realm of popular culture and environmental politics, ideas about native ecology merged with two long-standing currents in Western thought: exoticism (which emphasizes the attraction of cultural difference) and primitivism (which celebrates non-Western societies' antithetical relation to Western civilization and its corruptions). These intellectual traditions have a long history of distorting Westerners' relations with non-Western peoples (see Berkhofer 1978, 1988; Hemming 1978:1–23; Thomas 1994:173). Their recent recycling into a "green" guise deserves critical consideration.

For anthropologists, the trajectory of Amazonian eco-politics calls attention to the ironic divergence between the academic politics of postcolonial ethnography and the pragmatic politics of postcolonial ethnographic "subjects." Over the past two decades, myriad critiques of ethnographic representation have denounced tendencies to depict non-Western peoples in terms of essentialist images of cultural isolation, stasis, ahistoricity, and internal homogeneity (see, for example, Clifford 1988; Clifford and Marcus 1986; Said 1978; Wolf 1982). Contemporary ethnographers are enjoined to treat cultures as dynamic processes, not as bounded

objects frozen in time, and to recognize intracultural diversity and non-Western societies' engagement with global political, economic, and cultural processes.<sup>4</sup>

Simultaneously with this reorientation of ethnographic perspectives, political activism among indigenous peoples grew enormously around the world, adding weight to the pressures to recognize native involvement in global systems. Ironically, however, much of the most vociferous and effective indigenous activism (in Brazil and elsewhere) has been channeled into ethnic identity politics based on projecting generic essentialisms of the sort that anthropologists have come to regard as pernicious (see Thomas 1994:170–195).<sup>5</sup>

Indigenous self-representations present a paradox. On one hand, identity politics—especially in its ecological variants—have brought unprecedented visibility and transnational support to native peoples' struggles for land and legal rights critical to their survival. In many ways the participation of Amazonian Indians in transnational eco-politics represents a radical departure from dependency relations of the past. The Indian–environmentalist alliance articulates a model of partnership, not paternalism, and champions indigenous self-determination—the right of native peoples to make choices about their own destinies. On the other hand, even in this self-consciously anticolonial, postmodern politics, limiting stereotypes persist. Reductionist constructions of Indian identity ignore inter- and intracultural diversity and distort the complexity of native Amazonian goals and relations to natural environments and national economies. More troubling than the intellectual contradictions are the problematic political implications. Probing the ambiguities of translating authenticity through native body images highlights some of the tensions and contradictions in indigenous peoples' participation in end-of-the-millennium symbolic politics predicated on Western notions of cultural authenticity.

### indexing authenticity

The equation of visual exoticism (nudity, body paint, colorful ornaments) with genuine Indianness has persisted since the earliest European voyagers' accounts of their encounters with Brazil's native peoples (see Berkhofer 1978; Hemming 1978:1–23; Polhemus 1988:72–76). A classic example of the contemporary salience of the idea that cultural integrity can be read on the body surface was *People* magazine's 1988 article about the British rock singer, Sting, and his visit to a Kayapó village in central Brazil. The headline proclaimed: "On a Three-Day Tour Break, Sting Goes Native—Very Native—To Meet a Chief Amazon Indian." What is meant by going "native—very native" was elucidated by Sting himself, who exulted, "It didn't take long for the varnish of civilization to leave us. After 48 hours, we were naked, covered with paint, and fighting snakes" (*People* 1988:116). The two accompanying photographs attested to the seeming genuineness of the rock star's transcultural experience by emphasizing body transformations: one showed Kayapó designs painted on Sting's bare chest; the other focused on Chief Raoni's huge wooden lip disk.

For outsiders, native costumes tend to carry a heavy semiotic load. A study of *National Geographic* magazine by Catherine Lutz and Jane Collins found that readers perceived clothing to be the single most important marker of cultural identity: "Exotic dress alone often stands for an entire alien life-style, locale, or mind-set. . . . Local costume suggests something about the social stability and timelessness of the people depicted" (1993:92). The loss of traditional costume indexed the loss of cultural traditions: "Clothes identified as Western seemed often . . . to be a sign of cultural degradation, while non-Western clothing was taken as a sign of authenticity" (Lutz and Collins 1993:247).

This equation of non-Western cultural authenticity with visual exoticism and primitivism resonates with long-standing notions of "primitive" art. The Western art world defines primitive art as exotic (markedly different from the West) and ahistorical or unchanging.<sup>6</sup> Primitive artworks tend to be viewed as undifferentiated products of "age-old tradition governed by

communal custom" rooted in religious and mythical conceptions (S. Price 1989:64). The primitive is significant "above all because of an originary, socially simple and natural character" (Thomas 1994:173). This emphasis on cultural continuity as the essence of authenticity reflects a Western commonsense notion of tradition that "presumes that an unchanging core of ideas and customs is always handed down to us from the past" (Handler and Linnekin 1984:273; and see also Domínguez 1986:549; Linnekin 1991:447). Authenticity implies integration and wholeness—continuity between past and present, and between societal values and individual agency, and between sign and meaning (see Clifford 1988:215). This leaves little room for intercultural exchange or creative innovation, and locates "authentic" indigenous actors outside global cultural trends and changing ideas and technologies.

By the early 1990s, the *Far Side's* modernist stereotype opposing Western technology to native culture had been stood on its head. Striking counterimages came from Sting's hosts, the Kayapó, who became famous for their skill at turning video to indigenous purposes. Kayapó now film, produce, and edit videos that document their own dances and rituals, political events, and meetings with Brazilian politicians and corporate officials (Turner 1992a). Since 1989 global media have disseminated numerous pictures of Kayapó cameramen—resplendent in head-dresses, body paint, feathered armbands, and earrings—photographed in the act of filming.

The appropriation of complex Western technologies by indigenous people challenges views that equate authenticity with purity from foreign influences. The contested nature of this issue was evident in an incident described by Payakan, a Kayapó activist who was active in the Kayapó struggle to win legal rights to their land in the 1980s. A Brazilian judge questioned whether Payakan, an articulate, Western-educated individual, could legitimately represent the interests of less acculturated Kayapó:

Judge: "I understand that you know how to operate a VCR. Is this true?"

Payakan: "Yes, Your Honor."

Judge: "How can you call yourself an Indian if you work with these machines? Even I don't know how to use a VCR. How can you be a real Indian?"

Payakan: "Your Honor, the only reason that I know how to operate a VCR and your Honor doesn't is because I took the time to learn."<sup>7</sup>

The use of complex First World technology by Fourth World peoples is a trend that resonates worldwide. Solar panels, optic fiber technology, telephones, personal computers, modems, fax machines, camcorders, and VCRs have spread to some of the more remote corners of the global village (see Annis 1991, 1992; Zimmer 1990). Contemporary media revel in images of "primitive" folk with modern technology, the unexpected juxtaposition of "high-tech" Western elements next to "low-tech" indigenous elements such as feathers, body paint, lip plugs, and war clubs (Hess 1995:230–231). Primitive/modern visual contrasts have been a long-running theme in *National Geographic* magazine photography (Lutz and Collins 1993:110–112, 247–253) and are an increasingly prominent motif in advertising and fashion photography. Rather than marking the "natives" as active participants in the modern world system, such images tend to represent them as passive (and often confused or amazed) receptors of Western artifacts and the ironic gaze of Western viewers.

In anthropology, shifts in ethnographic representation echo the trend to acknowledge the spread of Western technologies to native peoples. Anthropologists celebrate the recent explosion of indigenous film and video production from Australia to the Americas (see, for example, Ginsburg 1991, 1993; Spitulnik 1993; Turner 1992a) and appreciate the possibilities implicit in turning Western technology to locally empowering, grassroots purposes (Annis 1991, 1992). The emphasis is on indigenous competency and control. No longer must we hide the VCR;

instead, it has become fashionable to highlight Third and Fourth World peoples' creative appropriation of "high-tech" foreign communications equipment.

Old stereotypes about how Western technology corrupts traditional cultures may be passé, but visual exoticism retains its enduring role in defining indigenous authenticity. (Post)modern/primitive juxtapositions work only in one direction: complex technology (or hyper-commercialism) plus exotic native body. Imagine the Kayapó cameraman clad in T-shirt and shorts or jeans (which is how Kayapó men dress much of the time at home). "Westernizing" the cameraman's costume would drain the image of its symbolic force and media appeal.

Today, with the shift away from essentializing notions of culture, few anthropologists would subscribe openly to a simplistic equation between exotic costume and authenticity. Nonetheless, there still is a general tendency "to see the retention of indigenous dress as a positive sign of cultural maintenance and strength" (Ehrenreich in press) and to consider the adoption of Western dress to be a sign of diminished cultural integrity. The imprint of this cultural coding is familiar to any ethnographers who have caught themselves sorting through fieldwork slides, selecting the more "interesting," "authentic" pictures with the fewest "foreign" or commercial "intrusions."<sup>8</sup>

### clothing as strategic dissembling

The appreciation for exotic native bodies expressed in contemporary Western popular culture is light-years away from the attitudes that most Amazonian Indians confront in dealing with non-Indians at the local level. In Brazil, Indians historically have had a number of motivations (pragmatic, social, and political) to reduce or abandon nudity and the use of native body styles. Every native group sustaining contact with outsiders has adopted Western clothing to some extent.

I work with the Wari' (Pakaa Nova), a population of about 1,500 people who live in the western Brazilian state of Rondônia.<sup>9</sup> The Wari' entered peaceful relations with the national society in the late 1950s and 1960s. Prior to the contact, they had no clothing; personal modesty (which Wari' value highly) was expressed in discreet body postures. Soon after the first contact, Wari' were inundated with unwanted attention because of their nudity. It became fashionable for army officers and their wives from the military base at Guajará-Mirim to take Sunday excursions upriver to the Tanajura contact site to stare at the naked savages. Wari' quickly understood the value of clothing in relations with outsiders. They now wear Western clothing at all times, including ritual occasions.

Many other aspects of Wari' life also changed after the contact, but they maintain a high degree of social cohesion and cultural integrity. The native language is the only language spoken in the vast majority of Wari' homes and there is little marriage with outsiders. In the past two decades, only a few Wari' have moved away and nearly everyone continues to depend on farming, hunting, fishing, and foraging to make a living. Visitors to Wari' villages are now frequently disappointed because "they don't look like real Indians," but Wari' themselves suffer no confusion about their own identity.

Most Brazilian Indians must interact with non-Indians (such as government agents, rubber-tappers, farmers, ranchers, shopkeepers, missionaries, nurses, and teachers) who view nudity as a sign of subhumanity, barbarism, and poverty, and who see body painting as a manifestation of negatively valued exoticism opposed to Brazilian social norms. In local interethnic encounters, using Western clothing may be a strategy to gain greater respect and equality in face-to-face interactions. Turner reports that this motivated Kayapó to adopt clothing some three decades ago:

The Kayapó had learned from their earliest contacts with Brazilians that nudity, lip plugs, body paint, and penis sheaths were inconsistent with minimal Brazilian standards of social intercourse. Recognizing that some social intercourse with Brazilians had become essential to their survival, they needed little urging

from SPI [Indian Protection Service] agents and missionaries to adopt minimal clothing and discard other flagrantly “savage” aspects of their traditional appearance. By the time of our arrival in 1962, most men had removed their lip plugs, had their hair cut short Brazilian style, and had taken to wearing shorts and occasionally T-shirts in the village. . . . The chiefs and most of the older men possessed complete Brazilian-style outfits (shoes, sometimes even socks, long pants, and long-sleeved shirts) for wear on trips to Brazilian towns, visits to the village by Brazilian officials, or attendance at the missionaries’ Sunday services; with such fancy-dress outfits no body paint or Kayapó ornaments were worn. [1992b:289]

Jeffrey Ehrenreich (in press) observes that among the Awá of eastern Ecuador, Western dress is part of a broader strategy of dissembling—of trying to appear as “normal” as possible in the eyes of outsiders, to avoid hostility and interference from outsiders. This dissembling serves Awá desires to be left alone; under a visual veneer of “sameness,” they are able to preserve important traditions, including their language and shamanic practices. “In daily life the Awá assert their cultural conformity in order to control their political autonomy. Dressing as such, they can hide in the background of a hostile and openly racist social milieu . . . thus reducing the degree to which they are targeted by the aggression of outsiders based on easily perceived differences.” For the Awá, as for the Kayapó and the Wari’, the abandonment of nudity and native body decorations, along with the adoption of Western clothing, was not a simple matter of acculturation or loss of cultural integrity. (For an illuminating discussion, see Veber 1992, 1996.) Rather, it may be understood more accurately as a strategic adaptation. As Ehrenreich observes, “the adoption of non-indigenous clothing, and the cultivation of an appearance which mirrors that of outsiders, serves to promote the cultural survival of the group at large.” Instead of speeding the destruction of indigenous cultural autonomy, nonnative dress may help to preserve it.

### new Amazonian mirrors

In the past decade and a half interethnic dress codes have undergone a revision: in some Brazilian Indian groups, male leaders and activists have resumed the use of native body decorations when meeting with outsiders.<sup>10</sup> In this and following sections, I explore how this change responded to the development of a communications infrastructure and technologies of representation that simultaneously broadened indigenous peoples’ political consciousness and expanded the arena for indigenous activism.

In the 1970s the Brazilian government launched a series of huge development projects aimed at creating an infrastructure to integrate the Amazonian interior with the rest of the country. The new roads and airstrips that cut through the rain forest sparked massive invasions of Indian lands and unleashed waves of violence and epidemics that devastated scores of native communities. This explosion of interethnic conflict catalyzed Indian activism and the development of pan-Indian organizing in opposition to government policies. Ailton Krenak, head of the pan-Indian organization, Union of Indigenous Nations (UNI), observes that “[a]nother factor [in the rise of Indian activism] is technological”:

The level of communication improved and people could hear what was going on and began to realize that all over the region Indian groups were experiencing the same problems. What began to happen was the emergence of a true indigenous voice. We had our own analysis and point of view that we ourselves could articulate. We didn’t want to be represented only by anthropologists. . . . Before the 1970s, few Indians were off the reservations, and an Indian off the reservation was a dead Indian. With the 1970s, Indians began to move into other parts of Brazil as Indians rather than half-breeds, and to participate as an autonomous political force, to send people down to Brasília [the national capital]. [Krenak as quoted in Hecht and Cockburn 1989:212–213]

For Indians living away from native communities, questions of identity and authenticity come to the fore along with the issue of body images. “(W)e spend most of our lives trying to reaffirm that we are Indians,” says Eliane Potiguara (1992:46), an urban-born Indian activist, “and then we encounter statements like, ‘But you wear jeans, a watch, sneakers, and speak Portuguese!’ . . . Society either understands Indians all made-up and naked inside the forest or consigns them

to the border of big cities." Combining native decorations with Western clothing offers a way to mark a distinctly indigenous identity. For migrants from rural Indian communities, this has the advantage of differentiating them from the non-Indian rural Amazonians (*caboclos*) and the urban poor who occupy the lower-class categories into which such Indians generally have been assimilated. It also has aesthetic appeal for the urban intellectuals who have been the major source of domestic political support for Indian causes.<sup>11</sup>

For Indians in native villages the 1970s and '80s brought the spread of communications technologies that reflected new self-images and offered new channels for self-representation. In particular, the development of compact, portable, battery-operated electronics enabled native Amazonians to participate for the first time in producing the images and information about themselves that circulate outside their communities. The cassette tape deck—much less cumbersome than reel-to-reel models—was a transformative innovation. In the late 1970s, Mario Juruna, a Xavante leader, captured Brazilian public attention by pioneering a visually oriented media politics that made extensive use of exotic body images, often juxtaposed with images of Western communications technology in indigenous hands (Conklin and Graham 1995; Hohlfeldt and Hoffmann 1982). Juruna was famous for using a cassette tape deck to record government officials' promises to Xavante seeking land titles; when promises were broken, he would call a press conference and play back the recordings. Flanked by dozens of boldly painted Xavante warriors armed with war clubs, bows, and arrows, Juruna staged dramatic confrontations with government officials that were broadcast nationwide on the television news. By the early 1980s, Juruna was a national symbol of opposition to the dictatorship.<sup>12</sup> He became a protégé of Darcy Ribeiro, an anthropologist-turned-politician, and in 1982, Juruna was elected (by urban voters in Rio de Janeiro) to the national Congress of Deputies. Juruna positioned himself as both insider and outsider to national party politics, a stance signified in his dress. As Congressman, he usually wore a well-tailored business suit but always kept his distinctive Xavante coiffure and earplugs.

Where Juruna's position required the trappings of elite business attire, later Indian activists positioned themselves as pure outsiders to mainstream politics and projected correspondingly different images. The Kayapó are a prime example. Turner reports, "Today, however, the same chiefs and other men are again wearing their hair long . . . when chiefs go to a Brazilian city, they make a point of wearing shorts (or sometimes long pants) and shoes, but no shirt or jacket. Their faces, arms, and upper bodies are painted, and they wear traditional shell necklaces and bead earrings. The whole ensemble is often topped off with a feather headdress . . ." (1992b: 299). In the case of the Kayapó, the revival of indigenous costume reflects a shift in the balance of power between them and Brazilian national society. Since the mid-1980s Kayapó communities have had an annual income of several million dollars in profits from a gold mine and contracts with commercial timber companies (Turner 1993:535–536). This money, combined with their exceptional skill at garnering media attention and support from celebrities like Sting, gives Kayapó considerable clout in dealing with outsiders. Even in some other native groups without such exceptional resources, however, a renewed pride in native body styles is evident. Again, technology has played a role.

Like the invention of the cassette tape deck, the development of portable, easy-to-operate video equipment put a powerful technology for self-representation into indigenous hands. Talal Asad (1991:323) observes that, just as modern modes of transportation altered time and space, so new modes of representation are helping to reconstitute colonized subjectivities.<sup>13</sup> Among the Wari', I saw the introduction of a simple cassette tape recorder spark renewed interest in Wari' music, which snowballed into a full-scale revival of major festivals that had not been held in more than 20 years.

Amazonian natives have long been the subject of outsiders' films, but video differs from film, not only in being cheaper and easier to use, but also in the fact that videotapes can be played



back on the spot for those who were filmed. The potential for this to transform native peoples' view of themselves was vividly illustrated in an incident recounted by Brazilian filmmaker Vincent Carelli, who directs a "Video in the Villages" project aimed at introducing video to Indian communities (see Carelli 1989). Carelli reports that when his team videotaped a Nambiquara female initiation rite, the Nambiquara participants were clad in their usual garb of dresses, shorts, and T-shirts:

When we finished filming, we all went into a hut and watched the ceremony, and people started complaining. . . . They didn't like it—they said they were wearing too much clothing and not enough paint on their faces. So we recorded it again. The young girl was taken out of the hut again, and the whole ceremony was re-enacted. The men wore smaller shorts and the women wore pieces of cloth tied around their waists as skirts. They were much happier with the result—they felt the film was more authentic. [Carelli as quoted in Smith 1989:30–31]

In this Nambiquara community, the self-reflective encounter with the "mirror" of video images evoked not just a one-time dressing up (or down) in native style but also more profound reassessments of how body images relate to cultural identity:

The tribe's young men, who hadn't pierced their upper lips or nose for 10 years because the passage-to-adulthood custom had died out as a result of their contact with the outside world, decided to stage a piercing ceremony for the camera. One adolescent, tears streaming down his cheeks as he stoically had his lip skewered by a bamboo stick [*sic*], was comforted by a tribal elder who said: "If you don't do this, how will you prove you are an Indian?" [Carelli as quoted in Smith 1989:30–31]

A question left open in this account is: why were Nambiquara youths newly willing to inscribe permanent marks of cultural difference on their faces in the late 1980s? Part of the answer may be that technologies are embedded in social contexts; video, television, and access to global media often have entered native Amazonian communities through encounters with outsiders who value indigenous cultural differences. For Nambiquara, ironically, such contacts intensified because of the much-criticized Polonoroeste development project—a huge colonization scheme financed by the Brazilian government and the World Bank. In 1984 Polonoroeste funded the paving of a highway that bisected Nambiquara territory; hundreds of thousands of migrants surged into the region, sparking massive deforestation and invasions of Indian reserves (see D. Price 1989). International protests over Polonoroeste's ecological and social impacts inspired a host of journalists, indigenist advocates, anthropologists, cinematographers, World Bank officials, and others to visit the Nambiquara to assess the situation.

When Carelli and his crew showed up with their camcorders, they were but the latest in a series of outsiders who had approached the Nambiquara expressing interest in their distinct cultural traits and, often, a concomitant lack of interest in, or devaluing of, Western innovations. In the code of the Brazilian class system, which Indians learn by direct experience, these people who valued indigenous culture were clearly high-status individuals—well-educated and often light-skinned, with access to sophisticated technology, commercial goods, and political connections. Turner describes how Kayapó political consciousness was transformed by similar encounters with anthropologists, photographers, journalists, and others:

The cumulative effect of these contacts was to catalyze the development of an awareness on the part of the Kayapó of the potential political value of their "culture" in their relations with the alien society. . . . [F]or many native peoples, the fact that anthropologists and other relatively prestigious outsiders, who plainly disposed of impressive resources . . . were prepared to spend these resources, not to mention much of their lives, on the study of native "cultures," may have done more than anything else to convey to these peoples the awareness that their traditional way of life and ideas were phenomena of great value and interest in the eyes of at least some sectors of the alien enveloping society. [Turner 1992b:301]

These Kayapó and Nambiquara experiences attest to the transformative power of new modes of self-reflection. As Amazonian Indians have seen themselves reflected in new ways—in the eyes of sympathetic outsiders, as well as on video screens—some have begun to envision and project new self-images.

If technology is changing how native Brazilians see themselves, it also has altered radically the dynamics of Amazonian interethnic politics by facilitating cooperation between native peoples and distant supporters. The same new roads and airstrips that carried hordes of invaders into Indian territories also made it easier for sympathetic outsiders and journalists to visit remote native villages and for Indians to travel to conferences, protest demonstrations, and political gatherings. Telephones, satellite communications systems, fax machines, computers, and VCRs offer native communities and organizations unprecedented abilities to communicate rapidly with allies and journalists in urban Brazil and foreign countries, as well as with other native groups.<sup>14</sup> The synergistic effects of linking electronic communications to attention-getting identity politics have been evident in a number of recent indigenous rights victories.

### **this *is* our suit and tie**

Of all Brazilian Indians, the Kayapó most fully realized the political possibilities of using indigenous dress and undress to play off Western symbolic constructs and gain media attention. This came to the fore in 1988 when two Kayapó leaders faced legal prosecution in a court in Belém, Pará. Payakan and Kube-i were accused of sedition (under a law applying to *foreigners*) for “betraying the national interest” by speaking with U.S. Congressmen and World Bank officials about funding for a hydroelectric dam project that would have flooded Kayapó villages (see CEDI 1991:326–28; Turner 1993:537). When Kube-i arrived at the courthouse to give his deposition, he appeared shirtless, wearing body paint and feathers—for which he promptly was charged with contempt of court and refused admittance to the public building (CEDI 1991:326). In response to the judge’s order to show respect by “dressing appropriately” in suit and tie, Kube-i replied, “Your Honor, this *is* how we Kayapó show respect. This *is* the Indian’s suit and tie.” Besides, he pointed out, “When we invite you to our village, we don’t ask you to take off your clothes and paint up like a Kayapó.”

Events surrounding this trial gave a vivid demonstration of Kayapó skill at the tactical deployment of native body images and symbols. Media attention was riveted on the stunning spectacle of more than 400 Kayapó—dramatically costumed warriors and nearly nude women—who staged brilliantly theatrical “war dances” to confront riot-control police armed with automatic weapons in front of the television and film crews clustered outside the courthouse (Black 1992:89). The ensuing publicity helped to generate numerous protests within Brazil and abroad, and the government suspended the sedition charges in early 1989. Kayapó successes inspired other Indian groups to engage in new forms of activism to defend their lands (Ireland 1991:56–57).

The most important indigenous rights victory—one that affected all Brazilian Indians—occurred in 1988, when the nation adopted a new constitution. For months while it was being written, hundreds of native leaders and representatives from several dozen Indian groups traveled to Brasília to lobby the Constituent Assembly delegates. Native costumes and attention-getting images attracted extensive television and press coverage. Ultimately the campaign paid off: the constitutional provisions that were ratified represented significant advances for the legal status and land rights of Indians and officially recognized their right to distinct languages, cultural traditions, and forms of social organization.

Brazilian Indian activists were able to turn exotic body images into effective political tools largely because new openings for indigenous activism developed at the national and international levels in the late 1980s (see Van Cott 1994). Democratization opened Brazilian political discourse to Indian voices, while the rise of international environmentalism created a global public receptive to Amazonian Indian causes.

## the greening of indigenist politics

The ideological basis for the Indian-environmental alliance was, of course, the growth of Western views of rain forest natives as “natural conservationists” whose traditional resource management practices embody Western environmentalist values of ecosystem preservation, sustainability, and appropriate technology (see Howard n.d.). The ecological rationales for promoting Amazonian Indians’ land rights and cultural survival that emerged in the late 1980s were premised on the idea of cultural continuity—the assumption that *past* traditions will orient *future* Indians to use natural resources in ways that are ecologically nondestructive. The eco-Indian alliance, in other words, hinges on a particular construction of indigenous authenticity.

With cultural survival reframed as a global environmental issue, Amazonian Indians gained influential new allies.<sup>15</sup> Before the 1980s, Brazilian Indian rights advocacy was grounded mostly in human rights arguments (Wright 1988); Indians had only a narrow base of domestic political support (primarily among intellectuals and leftist clerics) and limited foreign support. Connecting native issues to global ecology linked Fourth World (native) causes to much larger, better funded First World environmentalist networks (Brysk 1996).<sup>16</sup> International support freed some native Amazonian groups from their former dependence on local patronage and government officials, enabling them to take their causes directly to foreign supporters and media (Brown 1993:321).<sup>17</sup> International pressure became a critical factor in the campaign to create a reserve for the Yanomami, a victory won in 1991. It also figured in the impressive successes of the Kayapó. In the past decade, the Kayapó (who number some 4,000 people) have countered powerful corporate and state interests to prevent construction of what would have been the world’s largest dam, blocked government plans to dump radioactive waste on their land, asserted direct control over lucrative gold and timber operations, and won legal rights to a territory approximately the size of Scotland (Turner 1992a:14).

The “greening” of native struggles vastly expanded the audience receptive to indigenous messages, so that local conflicts over land and legal rights increasingly have been played out on an international stage where “the whole world is watching.” Brazilian Indians’ voices are now heard, and Indian faces are now seen, to an unprecedented extent. By the early 1990s, the presence of rain forest Indian representatives at major environmental conferences had become almost *de rigueur*. Individuals from certain Brazilian groups—notably the Kayapó, Yanomami, Xavante, and Kashinahua—became familiar faces on ecology lecture circuits, to the point where one almost might speak of the growth of an Amazonian international indigenous jet set.

In these foreign contexts, native costume assumed meanings diametrically opposed to the significance it usually carried in local Brazilian politics. As Alison Brysk (1996:46) notes, “[t]he image of Indian as Other was read differently by Latin American policymakers and international publics. To their compatriots, Indians’ appearance made them threatening, subhuman, or simply invisible; to North Americans and Europeans, it marked them as fascinating, exotic, and romantic.” At international gatherings, journalists flock to photograph Amazonian representatives in their dramatic headdresses, and lowland South American causes receive correspondingly high press coverage. Brysk (1996:46–47) interviewed an anthropologist who works with Central American Indians who pointed out that, with the exception of Guatemala (which is famous for colorful native dress), Central American Indians (and, one might add, Andean Indians also) “have received much less media attention than similarly situated and less numerous but ‘more colorful’ Amazonian peers.”

The strategic value of exotic images in attracting media attention was evident at the Altamira demonstration in April 1989—a giant protest and media event organized by the Kayapó and others opposed to plans to build a huge hydroelectric dam on the Xingú River. Thousands of non-Indians demonstrated against and in favor of the dam in mass rallies organized by regional labor unions and the Catholic church. But media reports—especially those directed to international

audiences—focused almost exclusively on the 700 or so Indian participants with their colorful headdresses, body paint, lip plugs, war clubs, and video cameras (Fisher 1994:222; and see Cummings 1990:63–88; Turner 1992a, 1992b). Indians from other tribes who turned out in solidarity found themselves being urged by the Kayapó to take off their Western clothing and put on native decorations (Pereira 1989).<sup>18</sup>

### advocacy and authenticity

The importance of symbolic markers of indigenous identity in Amazonian politics is intensified by the fact that most funding for Indian causes now comes from international agencies. Nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) such as Cultural Survival, Environmental Defense Fund, Friends of the Earth, National Wildlife Federation, Nature Conservancy, Rainforest Action Network, and World Wildlife Fund tend to be ideologically oriented to support grassroots communities and concerned that funds should not be consumed by bureaucratic intermediaries. The authenticity of Indian representatives is thus a matter of concern.

Jean Jackson reports that in the Colombian Amazon, reliance on international funding agencies is transforming indigenous groups' representations of their own cultures: "Tukanoans are beginning to want to retain their Indian identity not only because they continue to value their traditions and autonomy, but also because they increasingly need to demonstrate Indianness to obtain benefits from both government and NGOs" (Jackson 1995:12). In Colombia, pro-Indian organizations in Amazonia and in the Andean highlands articulate different political concerns and different symbolic constructions of Indianness (Jackson 1991). Contestations over authentic forms of Indianness have generated an implicit symbolic hierarchy of cultural purity in which lowland (Amazonian) Indians are seen as more authentic than Andean Indians, and Makú hunter-gatherers are seen as purer ("almost hyper-real Indians") in comparison to their horticulturalist neighbors, the Tukanoans (Jackson 1995:7, 20).<sup>19</sup>

The ways in which indigenous authenticity is communicated to the supporters of advocacy organizations constitute another concern. NGOs rely heavily on motivating donors to make voluntary contributions, and photographs, slides, and video are important fund-raising tools. Advocates who hope to evoke interest and sympathy for indigenous peoples often consciously recognize the potency of exotic visual images as symbolic communicators of authenticity. An extreme example of this was an incident that occurred some years ago in a Wari' community administered by the regional Catholic diocese and partially supported by European donations. When one of the priests was about to embark on a fund-raising campaign, the community overseer paid a group of young Wari' men to remove their clothes and pose naked for pictures to be shown at slideshows in France and Germany (Von Graeve 1989:125).

Uses of Amazonian Indian images by NGOs clearly do not rest on such blatant exploitation. Nonetheless, visual appearances can influence decisions about where to direct publicity and resources. Exotic-looking peoples like the Yanomami and Kayapó offer exceptionally "good visuals" for public relations. In Brysk's interviews with North American activists, "[a]n Indian rights supporter who has held several policy positions in the U.S. government" described how eco-activists viewed the Kayapó leader, Payakan, as an ideal "image-bearer to represent the complex issues of sustainable development and indigenous self-determination in the Amazon." Recalled the activist: "We needed someone to represent the human side. . . . Paiakan had a genuine appearance and of course the regalia made good media. He really seemed to represent the forest" (Brysk 1994:36). These symbolic associations are part of a Western aesthetic vocabulary out of which Amazonian activists constructed public images that turned notions of primitivism, authenticity, and environmentalism to the advantage of indigenous advocacy.

## eco-semiotics

When native Amazonian activists appear at media events and transnational gatherings, what types of body decorations do they use? A review of photographs of Brazilian Indian representatives in a variety of magazines, newspapers, videos, films, and NGO publications reveals considerable selectivity.<sup>20</sup> Traditional elements that are emphasized include: semi-nudity (men often do not wear shirts); colorful ornaments, especially feathered headdresses and earrings; and body paints, principally red annatto (*Bixa orellana*) and black charcoal, applied in rather limited quantities, principally to the face, arms, and torso. A notable feature of these body decorations is their impermanence: feathers, annatto, and charcoal can be easily put on and taken off.

It also is worth noting what types of body decorations are *not* emphasized. The semipermanent black dye genipap (*Genipa americana*), which is widely used in native Amazonian communities, appears infrequently in media contexts. The monkey-tooth bracelets and jaguar-tooth necklaces commonly worn by both Indians and non-Indians throughout the Amazon are also seldom seen on the environmental lecture circuit.

The traditional aesthetics of many native Amazonian peoples like the Wari' and Kayapó place a strong value on obtaining a smooth, sleek, heavily oiled body surface. In many groups, eyebrows are plucked, portions of the scalp are shaved, or sections of hair are cut in uneven lengths. Odors are also important; strong-smelling paints and ointments are often essential accessories for the well-dressed presentation of self. These aspects of native Amazonian body aesthetics, however, fail to survive the cross-cultural journey.

The body images that Indian activists have constructed resonate with the ideology and aesthetic sensibilities of their environmentalist allies. The rejection of Western costume obviously marks Indians' difference, separation, and opposition to Western traditions that, in environmentalist ideologies, are seen as destructive and corrupt.<sup>21</sup> Feathers are an evocative visual correlate to the oft-repeated idea of Indians as "close to nature."<sup>22</sup> Monkey and jaguar teeth might also evoke the idea of closeness to nature; they appear to be unacceptable, however, perhaps because they too graphically indicate acts of killing that offend Western sensibilities. (Feathers, in contrast, may or may not be obtained without killing the birds from which they originate.)

A related concept is the "naturalness" of Indians, who are represented as part of nature, born into a way of life that effortlessly embodies principles of Western conservationism. The downplaying of certain indigenous aesthetic elements—such as extreme haircuts, the removal of facial hair, and the heavy use of body oils—may reflect the fact that such radical modifications of the body contradict Western concepts of "natural" body aesthetics. In addition, such practices may edge toward communicating an undesirable degree of cultural difference. Indians are, after all, represented as essentially "like us," the responsible stewards of important resources, with views of nature that are presumed to be fundamentally similar to those of their non-Indian supporters. There is a fine line between the exotic and the alien—between differences that attract and differences that offend, unnerve, or threaten.

A final dimension of neo-indigenous body decorations is that, taken together, they evoke a dimension of mystery. The indigenous cultural meanings of body decorations always require translation for a Western audience. This translation may be as simple as *People* (1988:116) magazine's photo caption stating (erroneously) that a Kayapó chief "wears a lip disk to frighten enemies." Or it may be expressed with a more sophisticated reference to a headdress's mythological meanings. In any event, the *need for a translation of meaning* in itself evokes the existence of a level of ineffable experience and significance beyond the ken of Westerners. Just as nearly any sympathetic media discussion of native peoples inevitably alludes to their deep spirituality and harmony with nature, so the use of exotic decorations may have become a kind

of symbolic shorthand signaling an authentic, embodied experience of being that is presumed to be of an order entirely different from that of non-Indians (cf. Fry and Willis 1989:114).

In native Amazonian societies, corporeal ornamentation communicates complex, culture-specific messages that indicate “the relationship of the individual to his society” (Gregor 1977:176). The human body surface serves as a “social skin”—a sort of canvas where personal identity is expressed and an individual’s social identity and status are inscribed (Turner 1980; see, for example, Turner 1992c, and Vidal and Verswijver 1992 on cultural meanings of Kayapó body decorations). In interactions with non-Indians, however, these internal significances get lost. Meaning rests with the culture of secondary interpretation, which conflates all native decorations into a sign of generic Indianness. As Marianna Torgovnick (1990:82) observes, the elevation of the Other into the mainstream is often seen as decolonization; but it is still a process largely controlled by the West.

### natural symbols and political artifice

To acknowledge that the body images of native activists are produced in relation to Western discourses and media dynamics is not to say that Amazonian Indians have sold out. Nor are they passive victims of a Western “gaze,” cultural “others” put on display for outsiders’ ideological purposes. All politics are conducted by adjusting one’s discourse to the language and goals of others, selectively deploying ideas and symbolic resources to create bases for alliance. Reformulated representations of ethnic identity are strategic adaptations to specific political and social environments (Barth 1969). In their “rebellion against political invisibility,” their struggle to be seen and heard, Brazilian Indians must “appeal to the efficacy of certain symbols they know will strike home among whites. In this,” comments Ramos, “they are no different from the powers-that-be when the latter invoke, for instance, the image of the flag, the sound of the national anthem, the idea of Union, of *brasilidade* [Brazilianness], in an attempt to amass popular support and build legitimacy” (Ramos 1988:232). By identifying certain Amazonian cultural elements with Western values, Brazilian Indian activists developed visual images that proved spectacularly effective at getting their causes onto the world’s front pages and airwaves.

In costuming themselves to meet their audiences’ expectations, native activists partially accept the role assigned to them as representatives of exoticism; at the same time, however, they have tried to expand outsiders’ conceptions of who Indians are. Brazilian Indian activists traveling abroad have tended to mark their autonomy and distinctive agency by presenting themselves as mediating among multiple discourses and cultural systems, so that this display of complexity in itself undermines simplistic notions of a restrictive primitivism. The Kayapó, for example, did this by foregrounding their mastery of Western technologies. Turner (1992a:7) emphasizes that Kayapó see the dissemination of media images of their indigenous cameramen as essential to their self-definition in relation to the larger world. Their ostentatious affirmation that real natives *do* use VCRs aims to subvert limiting constructions of Indian identity and notions of fixed cultural boundaries and authentic types. Yet, as I noted at the beginning of this article, this can go only so far. The transnational audiences to whom eco-Indian activism must appeal retain relatively rigid ideas about cultural integrity and the importance of body images as signs of authenticity. Recognizing this, Kayapó cameramen dress the part for media events.

To dress to impress one’s allies and intimidate one’s opponents is nothing new for native Amazonians. What is new in media politics is the extent to which effective presentations of self must be tailored to fit outsiders’ ideas about how “authentic” Indians should appear. How this affects native peoples’ sense of themselves and their feelings of self-worth is a complex question with which South American ethnographers are just beginning to grapple.

Anthropologists who work with the Xavante and the Kayapó—the two groups with the most experience in mobilizing large numbers of native people for media events—emphasize the enhanced sense of self-worth and pride in cultural traditions that have come with their successes in confronting the outside world (Fisher 1994; Turner 1992b, 1993). Graham (1995 and personal communication) observes that when Xavante dress in native garb to confront their opponents they experience a dual sense of empowerment. First, they mark themselves as distinct from outsiders and as self-confident in their identity. Second, body decorations identify the individual with the larger Xavante collectivity, past and present. The act of applying body paint and putting on feathered ornaments connects the wearer with other Xavante and with the Xavante tradition of mythic discourses that celebrate the triumphs of heroic individuals who overcome great odds. That their distinctive body images have proved so effective as political theater further reinforces Xavante confidence in the supremacy of their traditions.

One wonders, however, whether these politics of representation might have different effects on other native peoples' sense of self-worth—if, for example, political efficacy required adopting costumes that their ancestors never wore. Identity politics can introduce new internal conflicts and new dependencies for indigenous communities. Such politics depend on the ability to translate native causes into terms identified with Western values and thus tend to favor younger, educated, bilingual individuals (especially men) (Brown 1993; Jackson 1991). The expanding use of Western communications technology adds another source of competition that enters into factional power struggles and intergenerational disputes. Among the Kayapó, for example, the role of video camera operator has become a way for ambitious young men to promote their political careers on the path to chieftainship, and access to video technology has become a focus of intracommunity conflicts (Turner 1992a:6–7). In addition, camcorders, fax machines, and computers cost substantial amounts of money and are easily broken and quickly outdated. Most Brazilian Indians gain access to high-tech equipment only through a relationship with an NGO or other outsiders, raising the specter of a new dependency. It remains to be seen what the economic and social costs of keeping up with the technological Joneses will be for native communities.

There may also be a political price for cultural politics that are heavily constrained by Western ideas about Indians. In the short run, exotic native images have served the shared interests of NGOs and Indians like the Kayapó who engage in symbolic politics aimed at an international public. Their effects in Brazilian domestic politics, however, have been more ambivalent.

An Amazonian leader's feathered headdress is no more (or less) artificial than a U.S. President's tuxedo. I suggest, however, that there is a difference in how the two costumes are perceived. Indigenous body decorations tend to be seen by outsiders, and represented by the activists who wear them, not merely as conventional attire or as costuming, but as integral expressions of the self—of spiritual and cultural roots. The salient message in the body styles discussed above is an affirmation of Indians as "natural" actors whose behavior flows from enduring traditions and primordial identity (see Howard n.d.). In part, it is these notions of naturalness and cultural continuity that distinguish indigenous claims from those of other ethnic minorities.

Non-Indian politicians suffer little damage from being perceived as strategic users of politically fashionable ideas. The public, however, has different expectations of Indians. The media-savvy manipulation of indigenous body symbols—what MacCannell (1976:98) calls "staged authenticity"—contradicts the rhetoric of naturalness. Theatricality is, to Western eyes, easily equated with acting (Denning 1993), and the putting on and taking off of native garb can look like posing—the antithesis of authenticity.<sup>23</sup>

Brazilian journalists were quick to pick up on this point in a vituperative press campaign aimed at undermining the legitimacy of the Indian rights movement (see Neves 1994). Over the past five years the Kayapó have borne the brunt of these attacks, which focused on accusing

them of hypocrisy and corruption for their involvement in lucrative commercial ventures while presenting themselves as ecologists and victims.<sup>24</sup> Photographs have been a prime weapon in this media war. A series of vitriolic exposés in the national news magazines *Veja* and *IstoÉ* (whose formats and public influence are similar to *Time* and *Newsweek* in the United States) featured photographic layouts in which pictures of exotically costumed Kayapó eco-activists were juxtaposed against pictures of the same individuals “off-stage,” dressed in Western clothes and engaged in “civilized” pursuits inaccessible to poor Brazilians—driving a car, eating at a fancy restaurant, working with high-tech equipment.<sup>25</sup>

Most indigenous people and anthropologists would agree that native political claims should not be judged by conformity to stereotypes of cultural purity. Yet pro-Indian rhetoric that invokes the content of “traditional culture” as an argument for native rights relies on similar distancing dichotomies and oppositional representations of Indian and non-Indian cultures. This approach can backfire when the gap between necessarily simplified representations and the complexities of Amazonian Indian communities’ own objectives becomes evident to outsiders. This is what has happened to the Kayapó, whose leaders forged alliances with environmentalists as a way to further their quest for self-determination and control over their land. Social scientists, journalists, and Kayapó activists have attributed Kayapó eco-activism to specific features of Kayapó culture and “the resiliency of their cultural traditions which flourish only in harmony with the tropical forest” (Fisher 1994:221). Fisher argues that by focusing on traditional cultural content, we miss the point that, for Kayapó, environmentalism is above all a strategic tool for communication and political mobilization.

Kayapó activists became masters of the art of translating their struggles against state and corporate powers into the conceptual framework of Western ecology. Internally, however, Kayapó (like most other Brazilian Indians) face difficult choices about how to generate the monetary income they need, and Kayapó factions differ in their attitudes toward commercializing natural resources. Some leaders—notably the elderly Chief Raoni—have used eco-activism to further communal goals and prevent the destruction of forest resources. Several other Kayapó leaders, in contrast, enriched themselves and their factions by granting timber companies concessions to clear-cut large tracts of virgin mahogany and other tropical hardwoods (*Economist* 1993; Turner 1993:533). The obvious contradictions between rhetoric and action provided hostile Brazilian media with powerful ammunition in their assault on Kayapó legitimacy.

While some aspects of the Kayapó story are specific to their situation, their experiences illustrate a broader problem in indigenous identity politics. There is a risk for Indians in relying on the symbolic capital of representations structured according to outsiders’ notions of what Indians are like. Indigenous actors who fail to conform to these images are categorized as corrupt and inauthentic, undermining the symbolic values on which their participation in transnational politics is based. Native activists face a quandary: they can forge alliances with outsiders only by framing their cause in terms that appeal to Western values and ideas about Indians, but this foreign framework does not necessarily coincide with indigenous peoples’ own visions of themselves and their futures.<sup>26</sup>

### artful competition

The images that Indian activists constructed as actors on the global political stage have also become a force in relations among native groups within Brazil. Wari’ from the communities where I work confronted this for the first time when some men attended a 1991 regional meeting of Rondônia’s “forest peoples,” where they were lectured by a Suruí Indian who exhorted them to take off their shirts during the meeting. The Wari’ representatives found this idea utterly foreign; as one man told it, “I said to the Suruí: ‘I don’t like that; I’m wearing my shirt.’ ”



Particular constructions of Indian identity privilege those who correspond best to the idealized image (Thomas 1994:189).<sup>27</sup> The feathered headdresses that formerly were part of Kayapó sacred rituals have become secular political props and the sine qua non of activist apparel. Not all Brazilian Indians have such headdresses. Wari', for example, use feathers as head ornaments in two ways: they either stick bits of white down onto oiled hair or insert a single scarlet macaw feather behind the crown. Neither style would translate well in the context of external political encounters, and neither has the visual impact and media appeal of Kayapó-type headdresses.

The Pataxó are a highly acculturated northeastern Brazilian group that also lacked elaborate featherwork and, to many outsiders' eyes, did not "look" like Indians. In the mid-1980s, they began a rancorous legal battle to regain rights to a valuable stretch of Atlantic coast property. Government officials and politicians questioned the legitimacy of their claims. Mario Juruna, the Xavante Indian Congressman, led a Congressional delegation to visit a Pataxó community that was under siege in a life-and-death standoff, surrounded by some 3,000 armed non-Indian settlers determined to evict them from the land. After his visit, Juruna enraged indigenous rights advocates when he told reporters that the Pataxó were not real Indians. "Indians don't have beards, or mustaches, or body hair," Juruna asserted (CEDI 1984:293). Subsequently, Pataxó leaders recognized the importance of external appearances in signifying authenticity and began to appear in public wearing feathered headdresses (Laura Graham, personal communication; compare, for example, photographs in CEDI 1984:292 and CEDI 1991:513, 525).

In contemporary identity politics, body images have become focal symbols encapsulating competing indigenous claims to authenticity. This was illustrated in an incident reported by an anthropologist who attended the international ecology conference ("Earth Summit") in Rio de Janeiro in June 1992 (Donald Pollock, personal communication). Native people, who were largely excluded from the official summit, organized a series of alternative events that aimed to put an indigenous stamp on the proceedings. (A "tribal village" erected outside the conference site was christened "*Kari-Ocá*"—a nativized rendering of *carioca*, the Portuguese term for residents of Rio de Janeiro.) Some of the main events were meetings of the International Indigenous Commission (IIC) at the alternative summit called the Global Forum. The IIC sessions devoted to drafting platform statements were intended to be for indigenous representatives only; no nonnative persons were to be admitted.

Defining who is "indigenous" in any single Latin American nation is difficult enough.<sup>28</sup> In an international gathering, it is nearly hopeless. Confronted with this dilemma, several Kayapó addressed the problem by stationing themselves as self-appointed bouncers at the doors of the conference room to determine who would be admitted. Faced with would-be participants as diverse as Filipino tribals and blond, blue-eyed Laplanders, they screened on the basis of appearance: only individuals wearing exotic, apparently non-Western costumes were admitted. Thus, when two North American Indians appeared dressed in street clothes, they were turned away. When the same two individuals returned the following day in beads and feathers, they entered without difficulty.<sup>29</sup>

On one hand, this incident demonstrates the admirable astuteness of Kayapó activists at creatively manipulating Western symbolic constructs to achieve their own political goals. On the other hand, such indigenous manipulation of foreign visual codes does nothing to subvert the questionable Western equation of authenticity with exotic body images. Indeed, it reifies that very equation.

In an era when it often pays to be a "real" Indian, the renewed emphasis on body images as an index of authenticity may work against the interests of people like the Wari', Awá, and Pataxó who do not fit outsiders' visual stereotype of authentic Indianness. The Wari' and Awá strategy of dissimulation, of trying to look as "normal" as possible, has, until now, been adaptive in dealing with outsiders at the local level. Ironically, it may prove to be a liability in a new situation in which alliances with distant supporters have become critical political resources, media

attention goes first and foremost to those who offer exotic visual images, and obtaining funding from governments and NGOs can depend on meeting criteria of authenticity (see Jackson 1995; Ramos 1994b). Even more ironic is the fact that, at the same time that indigenist rhetoric champions Indian self-determination, this media-oriented reification of exotic body images devalues the choices of people like the Wari' and Awá, who have strategically chosen to downplay their visual exoticism in order to preserve some degree of cultural autonomy.

## conclusion

Two contrasting images of native costumes juxtaposed with Western technology have framed this essay, reflecting divergent models of cultural identity. The first—our glimpse of the *Far Side's* grass-skirted natives hastening to hide their television and VCR—expresses a long-standing view of cultural identity as an impermeable boundary to be maintained. In this modernist aesthetic, the primitive and the civilized must be kept separate, the taboo enforced against mixing bodies, beliefs, or technologies.

The second image—the picture of a Kayapó video cameraman in body paint and feathers—reflects a contemporary rethinking of these categories. This is a vision in which cultural identity is not defined by fidelity to traditions but instead is seen as “mixed, relational, and inventive” (Clifford 1988:10). The video camcorder, postmodern icon par excellence, marks the impetus of globalization, the blurring and shifting of boundaries between peoples and technological systems, and the corresponding transformations of individuals' sense of self and place in the world. In indigenous hands, the camcorder also stands as a sign of the refusal of native peoples to fit into other people's stale categories—of their capacity to define, and insistence on defining, cultural futures on their own terms.

Around the margins of this discussion, perhaps there lurks a third, more easily forgotten image: of Wari' men in their store-bought shirts and polyester pants, not fitting much of anybody's idea (but their own) of what Indians ought to look like.

As different as our readings of these three images are, they share a common theme: the role of exotic appearances as markers of indigenous authenticity. In this article, I have explored why this equation persists, and is even reinforced, in the postcolonial politics of eco-Indian activism. Transnational symbolic politics propel native activists to present themselves and their causes in terms of essentialisms that fit into the narrow imaginative space allowed for Indians in Western popular imaginations. Doing so has served many Indian interests well, as evidenced by the concrete gains of the past decade. Throughout the Americas, indigenous issues are now on the agendas of governments and NGOs to an unprecedented extent, and bureaucrats in offices ranging from the World Bank to remote outposts of Brazil's Indian agency are aware that they will have to answer questions about how their policies affect Indians. The heightened visibility of native causes has influenced environmentalism as well. A decade or so ago, environmentalists mostly talked about the need to preserve flora and fauna; today they are more likely to speak of “sustainable development” that recognizes forest peoples' right to make a living using natural resources. These changes came about largely because native activists and their NGO allies made indigenous identity politics a force to be reckoned with.

Brazilian Indians' experiences, however, also call attention to limitations and tensions that are inherent in symbolic politics. However positive their content, essentialist constructions of Indian identity constitute a “legislation of authenticity” (Thomas 1994:179) that can work against Indian interests, undermining the legitimacy of both native people who promote them and those who do not. People like the Wari', who do not conform to idealized images, tend to be seen by outsiders as not Indian enough, or not the “right” kind of Indians. People like the Kayapó, who capitalize on symbolic identifications with Western values, are perceived as corrupt poseurs when their actions diverge from the messages that outsiders read in their public

images. Given the complex economic and political pressures that confront Amazonian Indian communities today, it is inevitable that native peoples' self-determined choices often will diverge from the expectations held by outsiders who locate authenticity in static cultural traditions. As Turner comments,

One of the most disconcerting things about free-ranging "Others" to some current Western champions of cultural "difference" is how little concerned they tend to be with the "authenticity" of their life-styles, as defined from the base-line of nostalgic . . . notions of "traditional culture." [1992a:12]

The paradox of contemporary indigenous eco-identity politics is that many of its most powerful arguments for indigenous rights rely on invoking just such notions about "traditional culture." Reification of cultural difference is hardly unique to indigenous activism; with the rise of multiculturalism, ethnic politics of all sorts emphasize oppositional representations that reduce intragroup diversity to idealized, homogenized images. In this respect, the essentializing of Indian images may be an inevitable component of any effective symbolic politics.

What distinguishes Amazonian eco-politics from other kinds of identity politics—and what makes symbolic reductionism especially problematic—is the degree to which cultural identity (packaged to appeal to Western aesthetics) constitutes the major source of Brazilian Indians' power to create a broad base of public support. There is an inherent asymmetry at the core of the eco-Indian alliance: the symbolic value of Indian cultural identity is bestowed on terms defined primarily by non-Indians. Transnational symbolic politics accommodate native peoples' definitions of themselves and their goals only to the extent that these self-definitions resonate with Western ideological and symbolic constructs. The irony of this pro-Indian politics is that, by insisting that native Amazonian activists must embody "authenticity," it may force them to act "inauthentically."

## notes

*Acknowledgments.* The ideas I present here were first sketched out in papers presented at the annual meetings of the American Ethnological Society in Santa Fe, NM, in April 1993, and the 92nd American Anthropological Association meetings in Washington, DC, in November 1993. I would like to thank Deborah Gewertz, Laura Graham, Thomas Gregor, Jean Jackson, Stuart Kirsch, Larry McKee, Donald Pollock, David Price, and William Fisher for helpful comments during the paper's evolution. I am especially grateful to Catherine Howard for her careful reading of the text and generous insights. Fieldwork among the Wari' was supported by the Inter-American Foundation, the Fulbright Commission, and the Wenner-Gren Foundation.

1. In a critique of essentialisms, it is disconcerting to fall back on the reifying terminology of *Western, non-Western, First World, Fourth World*, and so on. I do so reluctantly, in the absence of convenient alternatives. The reader should keep in mind that these are fuzzy, contextually determined categories.

2. On the question of how Native American ecological orientations differ from Western environmentalism, see *Cultural Survival Quarterly* 1991, Redford 1990, Simard 1990, and White and Cronon 1988. A growing ethnographic literature addresses the question of whether indigenous peoples' views of nature are consistent with Western environmentalist principles and whether such views contribute to the regulation of ecological processes. See, for example, Ellen 1993, Hames 1987, Sillitoe 1993, and Stocks 1987. López (1994) presents a critique of Redford's (1990) interpretation of the "Ecologically Noble Savage" image.

3. For reviews of recent literature on native Amazonian environmental knowledge and resource management practices, see Berlin 1992, Clay 1988, Hames and Vickers 1983, Posey and Balée 1989, Redford and Padoch 1992, and Sponsel 1995.

4. Along with changing views of culture has come a revision in anthropological views of tradition. Where earlier generations held an organic model of "culture" as an entity that endures over time and equated the "invention of tradition" (Hobsbawm and Ranger 1983) with inauthenticity and insincerity, contemporary scholars, following Wagner 1975, have "naturalized the artifice of invention" (Thomas 1992:213). Anthropologists increasingly recognize that "all traditions—Western and indigenous—are invented, in that they are symbolically constructed in the present and reflect contemporary concerns and purposes rather than a passively inherited legacy" (Linnekin 1991:447). From this perspective, the reformulation of ethnic identity is seen not as ersatz repackaging but as a creative, negotiated enterprise.

This academic view, however, is at odds with much discourse in contemporary ethnic politics. A case in point is the controversy that erupted in New Zealand in response to Hanson's 1989 article, which showed that key aspects of Maori oral tradition were authored by Europeans. As Linnekin (1991:447) observes,

"[w]hat many anthropologists view as an advance in cultural theory can be read popularly as 'destructive' of native claims to cultural distinctiveness." Warren (1992) presents a provocative example from Guatemala, where Mayan intellectuals responded negatively to her presentation of a cultural constructionist interpretation of ethnicity as fluid and contextual; instead, the Maya asserted that Indian identity should be located in the continuity of cultural traits. Warren notes the irony that "North American anthropology is exploring social constructionist perspectives on ethnicity at the very moment Mayas have rediscovered essentialism. . . . For Mayas—who are, in actuality, creating all sorts of novel ethnicities and levels of identity—essentialism is a powerful rejection of the Ladino definition of Mayas as the negative or weaker other" (1992:209). See Campbell 1996:93 for a penetrating critique of anthropologists' positions in clashes with Mayan intellectuals over constructivist interpretations of identity. On the clash between anthropological representations and ethnic self-representations in identity politics, see Friedman 1992; Jackson 1989, 1995; and Linnekin 1991. Handler (1985) discusses problems in anthropological writings that take "the native's point of view" (and thereby employ the native's reified categories) in nationalist movements that construct ethnicity and culture as bounded objects.

5. The issues raised here resonate far beyond the Amazon. On parallels in Australian cultural politics and Aboriginal imagery, for example, see Hamilton 1990; Myers 1991, 1994; and Thomas (1994:170–195).

6. Received notions about primitive art have come in for a great deal of criticism recently. In particular, the equation of authenticity with cultural stasis has been thoroughly discredited in academic art criticism (Errington 1994:202; and see Clifford 1988; Fabian 1983; Price 1989; Torgovnick 1990). My concern here is with the considerable influence this notion retains in Western popular culture.

7. I am grateful to Catherine Howard for this account, which Payakan presented in a speech in Toronto, Canada, in December 1988, for which Howard translated.

8. Keesing 1994 suggests that reification and essentialism are inherent in anthropological conceptions of culture and anthropologists' vested interests in emphasizing the exotic otherness of those they study. Founded on an emphasis on cultural differences, anthropology is pervaded by hierarchies of exoticism and cultural purity; the discipline has long accorded greater prestige to those who study remote, "purer" cultures (Herzfeld 1987; and see Carrier 1992, Jackson 1995:19). Keesing argues that this tendency persists even among postmodernist American cultural anthropologists with roots in the interpretive/cultural constructionist tradition, despite their avowed concern with transcending old preoccupations with authenticity and closed boundaries. "Critically examining the takens-for-granted of Western thought, post-structuralism has undermined the old dualisms—civilized vs. primitive, rational vs. irrational, Occident vs. Orient. . . . Yet at the same time, poststructuralist thought, too, urgently needs radical alterity, to show that our takens-for-granted represent European cultural constructions" (Keesing 1994:302).

9. On Wari' (Pakaa Nova) society and interethnic relations, see Conklin 1989, 1995; Mason 1977; Meireles 1986; Vilaça 1992; and Von Graeve 1989.

10. This discussion focuses on male costume because few Brazilian Indian women have been prominent in national and transnational activism. One exception was Tui'ra, a Kayapó woman who became famous at the Altamira protest when she brandished a machete in the face of the utility company spokesman. Tui'ra later traveled to the United States on a speaking tour. It is worth considering whether Western preferences for certain native body images favor male activists, who can display their bodies in ways that women cannot.

11. Visual exoticism evokes romantic images of Indians that have a long-standing place in Brazilian intellectual history. Generations of writers and artists have looked to the nation's Indian roots in attempts to construct a distinct nationalist identity "with a unique, non-European flavor" (Ramos 1994b:78). A central idea is the image of the Indian as "natural man"—courageous, sensual, and free from repressive societal conventions: distanced from the status quo, yet quintessentially Brazilian (Pereira 1990).

12. Ramos (1994b) notes that, under the dictatorship, "a common procedure [for non-Indian opponents of the government] . . . was to use the Indian issue as a channel to air criticisms against the military regime. . . . The 'Indian' theme was then one of the very few political issues one dared raise without being caught by censorship." On the changing politics surrounding "the Indian question" in Brazil, see Maybury-Lewis 1991.

13. On indigenous cinematography and issues of how film and video interact with indigenous self-reflection and self-representation, see Arhem 1993; Carelli 1989; Elsass 1991; Ginsburg 1991, 1993; and Turner 1992a.

14. The potential of "informational empowerment" (Annis 1992) for geographically and politically marginalized groups was dramatized in January 1994, when Zapatista guerrillas in the rain forest of Chiapas, Mexico, sent their communiqués and war dispatches directly to a global public via e-mail and the Internet. The Internet, suggests Halleck, is a powerful tool for generating solidarity:

The Chiapas computer conferences [with Zapatista guerrillas on-line] . . . have allowed many people to feel closer to a revolutionary process. . . . Perhaps the most effective outcome of Chiapas on-line has been the boosting of psychological morale of Latin American activists, anti-GATT cadre and human rights workers worldwide. . . . There was a sense of direct connection, of an authentic "interactive" movement, as groups and individuals forwarded messages, excerpted passages, pinned up tear sheets and posted their own comments on-line. [1994:32]

15. Opposition to ecologically destructive development schemes also offered a rallying point for cooperation among Indians groups who formerly had little common ground. Pan-Indian organizations

proliferated in Brazil in the 1980s and found a stronger voice and broader political support by appealing to environmental concerns (Brysk 1996); and see Rich 1994.

16. On the history of linkages between environmental NGOs and native rights organizations in Brazil, see Arnt and Schwartzman 1992; Brysk 1994, 1996; Schwartzman 1991; and Van Cott 1994.

17. Transnational NGOs have been especially well-positioned to influence Brazilian policy during the past decade because the nation's huge debt to multinational lending agencies made the government and national business elites sensitive to foreign criticism (Fisher 1994:220; Viveiros de Castro 1992:14).

18. A number of events discussed in this article appear in videos available in the United States. *Kayapo: Out of the Forest* (Granada Television's Disappearing World series) chronicles Kayapó participation in the mega-demonstration at Altamira against the Xingú River dam project. *Amazonia: The Road to the End of the Forest* (Canadian Broadcasting Corporation) includes scenes of the Kayapó demonstrations outside the courthouse during the trial of Kube-i and Payakan. The filming of the Nambiquara female initiation ritual, including the villagers' reactions to watching the video and their subsequent restaging of the ceremony, appears in *A Festa da Moça*, narrated in English. Geoffrey O'Connor's *Amazon Journal* (Filmmaker's Library) explores outsiders' conflicting stereotypes of Indians, focusing on the Yanomami, Kayapó, and the 1992 Earth Summit.

19. Ramos, an anthropologist who works with the Yanomami, takes a more critical view. She suggests that in Brazil, some indigenist advocacy organizations have a hard time dealing with flesh-and-blood Indians whose goals and behavior do not match the idealized images on which NGO support for Indians is premised. Following Baudrillard's notion of the simulacrum, in which "signs of the real [substitute] for the real itself" (Baudrillard 1983:4), Ramos argues that NGO bureaucracies tend to create "a simulacrum of the Indian: dependent, suffering, a victim of the system, innocent of bourgeois evils, honourable in his actions and intentions, and preferably exotic. . . . That," she caustically remarks, "is why the Yanomami are so popular among NGOs" (Ramos 1994b:163).

20. CEDI 1991 is an excellent source of photographs of Brazilian Indian representatives in a variety of domestic and foreign contexts.

21. The emphasis on Indians as outsiders to Western civilization reflects the oppositional stance adopted by many indigenous rights movements in Latin America. Hale 1994 observes that in contrast to leftist attempts to subvert the dominant system from within, *indigena* resistance "attacks Mestizo society from the outside; rather than attempting to shift the balance of power by subverting particular symbols from within, they reject the Mestizo culture wholesale." *Indigena* identity politics emphasize "radical difference: their spiritual grounding, their disdain of the materialism and quest for political power inherent in Western culture, their adherence to a distinct world view, all of which imbues *indigena* identity with a content of radical political opposition" (Hale 1994:28).

22. Ramos (1994a) traces historical transformations of the edenic discourse of Brazilian Indians as inhabitants of Paradise on Earth from the 16th century to contemporary environmentalism.

23. Ambivalence or hostility toward indigenous activists and assertions about their inauthenticity often are expressed through statements about native dress. Nelson (1994) discusses the proliferation of jokes about Rigoberta Menchú, the Mayan leader who was awarded the 1993 Nobel Peace Prize. Menchú always appears in the distinctive costume (*traje*) of her people. Jokes told by Ladinos (non-Indian Guatemalans) typically revolve around puns about her costume—implying, for example, that she is "hiding" something beneath her skirts—in other words, that she is not who she presents herself to be.

24. Accusations of hypocrisy, of "posing" for foreigners, resonate with the Brazilian concept of *para inglês ver*, "for English to see"—an ironic reference to historical tendencies for Brazilian elites selectively to present images that satisfy foreigners (see Fry 1982). A classic example of *para inglês ver* occurred during the 1992 Earth Summit, when the government cleaned up Rio de Janeiro in anticipation of the international visitors' arrival. In a city where millions of people lack the most basic housing and sanitation, huge amounts of money were poured into constructing nature walks and jogging trails, refurbishing parks, and financing police sweeps that removed street children and beggars from the vicinity of the conference.

25. For examples of negative press articles on the Kayapó, see *Veja* 1993 and Viana 1992. Some of the most vicious media attacks have been directed at Payakan, who was accused of violently raping a Brazilian woman just before the start of the June 1992 Earth Summit. The June 10 cover of *Veja* featured a close-up of Payakan's painted face above the caption "The Savage" (*O Selvagem*). (Ironically, *Veja*'s cover photo of Payakan was taken from the cover of *Parade* magazine, where it had appeared above a very different caption: "A Man Who Would Save the World"; see Whittemore 1992.) The accompanying story made extensive use of photographic contrasts showing Payakan as exotically costumed eco-activist and comparing this image to Payakan clad in Western attire (Gomes and Silber 1992). A great deal of confusion surrounded the rape accusation and the legal charges were dropped in November 1994. For an insightful analysis of media treatments of Payakan, see McCallum 1995.

26. The Kayapó are unusual in terms of the amount of income that they have earned from timber and gold mining concessions. They are, however, far from unique in being willing to consider proposals to exploit forest resources for short-term profits at the expense of long-term productivity. (See Colchester 1989 on the difficulties that Amazonian Indians face in finding ways to participate in the cash economy.) In Brazil, Indian leaders have consistently defined self-determination to include control over their lands' natural resources and the right to use them as they see fit. In several cases in which native communities have asserted control over commercially valuable resources, they have chosen environmentally destructive options, such as clear-cutting or intensive logging (see Redford 1990, Turner 1993). Recently, however, some Kayapó

leaders and factions have rebelled against the large-scale commercialization of tribal resources and are promoting environmentally sustainable alternatives (see Turner 1995).

27. Feest (1990) examines Europeans' long history of lionizing American Indian visitors, which has spawned numerous instances of non-Indians passing themselves off as Indians by dressing the part. He observes, "Some of these fake visitors look like they came straight out of the ever-popular Indian novels . . . those whose appearance closely matched the imagery stood and stand a better chance of being taken for real" (Feest 1990:322-23).

28. See the collection of articles in Urban and Sherzer 1991 on the complex issues involved in defining and maintaining Indian identity in various Latin America societies.

29. In the final ironic twist in this affair, complaints from many not-obviously indigenous indigenous people led to a decision to distribute T-shirts to all "certified" representatives of indigenous organizations and restrict access to the IIC meeting to individuals wearing these T-shirts. In their haste to get the shirts printed quickly, organizers opted to use a graphic design that was close at hand: the feathered headdress logo of FUNAI (National Indian Foundation), the Brazilian government agency that is a perennial focus of criticism from Indians and pro-Indian advocacy organizations (Donald Pollock, personal communication).

## references cited

Annis, Sheldon

1991 Giving Voice to the Poor. *Foreign Policy* 84:93-106.

1992 Evolving Connectedness among Environmental Groups and Grassroots Organizations in Protected Areas of Central America. *World Development* 20:587-595.

Appadurai, Arjun

1990 Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy. *Public Culture* 2(2):1-24.

Arhem, Kaj

1993 *Millennium* among the Makuna. *Anthropology Today* 9(3):3-8

Arnt, Ricardo Azambuja, and Stephan Schwartzman

1992 *Um Artificio Orgânico: Transição na Amazônia e Ambientalismo (1985-1990)*. (An organic artifice: Transition in Amazônia and environmentalism [1985-1990].) Rio de Janeiro: Rocco.

Asad, Talal

1991 From the History of Colonial Anthropology to the Anthropology of Western Hegemony. In *Colonial Situations*. George Stocking, ed. Pp. 314-324. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.

Barth, Fredrik

1969 Introduction. In *Ethnic Groups and Boundaries*. Fredrik Barth, ed. Pp. 9-38. Boston: Little, Brown.

Baudrillard, Jean

1983 *Simulations*. New York: Semiotext(e).

Berkhofer, Robert E., Jr.

1978 *The White Man's Indian*. New York: Random House.

1988 White Conceptions of Indians. *Handbook of North American Indians*, 4: History of Indian-White Relations. Wilcomb E. Washington, ed. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press.

Berlin, Brent

1992 *Ethnobiological Classification*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Black, Jan Knippers

1992 Brazil's Limited Redemocratization. *Current History* (February):85-89.

Bourdieu, Pierre

1977 *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Richard Nice, trans. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

1984 *Distinction: A Social Critique of Judgement and Taste*. Richard Nice, trans. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Brown, Michael F.

1993 Facing the State, Facing the World: Amazonia's Native Leaders and the New Politics of Identity. *L'Homme* 33(2-4):307-326.

Brysk, Alison

1994 Acting Globally. In *Indigenous Peoples and Democracy in Latin America*. Donna Lee Van Cott, ed. Pp. 29-51. New York: St. Martin's Press.

1996 Turning Weakness into Strength: The Internationalization of Indian Rights. *Latin American Perspectives* 23, No.2 (89):38-57.

Campbell, Howard

1996 Isthmus Zapotec Intellectuals: Cultural Production and Politics in Juchitán, Oaxaca. In *The Politics of Ethnicity in Southern Mexico*. Howard Campbell, ed. Pp. 77-98. Nashville: Vanderbilt University Publications in Anthropology.

Carelli, Vincent

1989 Video in the Villages: Utilization of Video Tapes as an Instrument of Ethnic Affirmation among Brazilian Indian Groups. *CVA Review*, Fall.

Carrier, James G.

1992 Occidentalism: The World Turned Upside Down. *American Ethnologist* 19:195-212.

- CEDI (Centro Ecumênico de Documentação e Informação) [Ecumenical Documentation and Information Center]
- 1984 Povos Indígenas no Brasil/1984. (Indigenous peoples in Brazil/1984.) Aconteceu Especial 15. São Paulo.
- 1991 Povos Indígenas no Brasil: 1987, 1988, 1989, 1990. (Indigenous peoples in Brazil: 1987, 1988, 1989, 1990.) Aconteceu Especial 18. São Paulo.
- Clay, Jason W.  
1988 *Indigenous Peoples and Tropical Forests*. Cambridge, MA: Cultural Survival.
- Clifford, James  
1988 *The Predicament of Culture: Twentieth-Century Ethnography, Literature, and Art*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Clifford, James, and George E. Marcus, eds.  
1986 *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Colchester, Marcus  
1989 Indian Development in Amazonia: Risks and Strategies. *The Ecologist* 19(6):249–254.
- Conklin, Beth A.  
1989 Images of Health, Illness and Death among the Wari' (Pakaas Novos) of Rondônia, Brazil. Ph.D. dissertation, University of California, San Francisco and Berkeley.  
1995 "Thus Are Our Bodies, Thus Was Our Custom": Mortuary Cannibalism in an Amazonian Society. *American Ethnologist* 22:75–101.
- Conklin, Beth A., and Laura Graham  
1995 The Shifting Middle Ground: Amazonian Indians and Eco-Politics. *American Anthropologist* 97:695–710.
- Cultural Survival Quarterly  
1991 Just What Is Conservation? *Cultural Survival Quarterly* 15:20–29.
- Cummings, Barbara J.  
1990 *Dam the Rivers, Damn the People: Development and Resistance in Amazonian Brazil*. London: Earthscan Publications.
- Denning, Greg  
1993 The Theatricality of History Making and the Paradoxes of Acting. *Cultural Anthropology* 8:73–95.
- Dominguez, Virginia R.  
1986 The Marketing of Heritage. *American Ethnologist* 13:546–555.
- Economist  
1993 The Savage Can Also Be Ignoble. *The Economist* 327(7815):54.
- Ehrenreich, Jeffrey David  
In press The Awá Body Transformed: Identity, Dissembling, and Resistance among an Indigenous People of the "True" Rainforest. In *Native South Americans*, 2nd ed. Patricia Lyon, ed. Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press.
- Ellen, Roy  
1993 Rhetoric, Practice and Incentive in the Face of the Changing Times: A Case Study in Nuauulu Attitudes to Conservation and Deforestation. In *Environmentalism: The View from Anthropology*. Kay Milton, ed. Pp. 126–143. New York: Routledge.
- Elsass, Peter  
1991 Self-Reflection or Self-Presentation: A Study of the Advocacy Effect. *Visual Anthropology* 4:161–173.
- Errington, Shelly  
1994 What Became Authentic Primitive Art? *Cultural Anthropology* 9:201–226.
- Fabian, Johannes  
1983 *Time and the Other: How Anthropology Makes Its Object*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Feest, Christian F.  
1990 Europe's Indians. In *The Invented Indian: Cultural Fictions and Government Policies*. James A. Clifton, ed. Pp. 313–332. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction.
- Fisher, William H.  
1994 Megadevelopment, Environmentalism, and Resistance: The Institutional Context of Kayapó Indigenous Politics in Central Brazil. *Human Organization* 53:220–232.
- Friedman, Jonathan  
1992 The Past in the Future: History and the Politics of Identity. *American Anthropologist* 94:837–859.
- Fry, Peter  
1982 Para Inglês Ver: Identidade e Política na Cultura Brasileira. (For English to see: Identity and politics in Brazilian culture.) Rio de Janeiro: Zahar Editores.
- Fry, Tony, and Anne-Marie Willis  
1989 Aboriginal Art: Symptom or Success? *Art in America*, July:109–116, 159–160, 163.
- Ginsburg, Faye  
1991 Indigenous Media: Faustian Contract or Global Village? *Cultural Anthropology* 6:92–112.  
1993 Aboriginal Media and the Australian Imaginary. *Public Culture* 5:557–578.

- Gomes, Laurentino, and Paulo Silber  
 1992 A Explosão do Instinto Selvagem. (The explosion of the savage instinct.) *Veja* (São Paulo, Brazil) 25(24):68-84, June 10.
- Graham, Laura R.  
 1995 *Performing Dreams: Discourses of Immortality among the Xavante of Central Brazil*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Gregor, Thomas  
 1977 *Mehinaku: The Drama of Daily Life in a Brazilian Indian Village*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Hale, Charles R.  
 1994 Between Che Guevara and the Pachamama: Mestizos, Indians and Identity Politics in the Anti-Quincentenary Campaign. *Critique of Anthropology* 14:9-39.
- Halleck, Deedee  
 1994 Zapatistas On-Line. *NACLA Report on the Americas* 28(2):30-32.
- Hames, Raymond  
 1987 Game Conservation or Efficient Hunting? In *The Question of the Commons: The Culture and Ecology of Communal Resources*. Bonnie J. McCay and James M. Acheson, eds. Pp. 92-107. Tucson: University of Arizona Press.
- Hames, Raymond, and William Vickers, eds.  
 1983 *Adaptive Responses of Native Amazonians*. New York: Academic Press.
- Hamilton, Annette  
 1990 Fear and Desire: Aborigines, Asians, and the National Imaginary. *Australian Cultural History* 9:14-35.
- Handler, Richard  
 1985 On Dialogue and Destructive Analysis: Problems in Narrating Nationalism and Ethnicity. *Journal of Anthropological Research* 41:171-182.
- Handler, Richard, and Jocelyn Linnekin  
 1984 Tradition, Genuine or Spurious. *Journal of American Folklore* 97(385):273-290.
- Hanson, Allan  
 1989 The Making of the Maori: Culture Invention and Its Logic. *American Anthropologist* 91:890-902.
- Hecht, Susanna, and Alexander Cockburn  
 1989 *The Fate of the Forest: Developers, Destroyers and Defenders of the Amazon*. New York: Verso.
- Hemming, John  
 1978 *Red Gold: The Conquest of the Brazilian Indians, 1500-1760*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Herzfeld, Michael  
 1987 *Anthropology through the Looking-Glass: Critical Ethnography in the Margins of Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hess, David  
 1995 *Science and Technology in a Multicultural World: The Cultural Politics of Facts and Artifacts*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Hobsbawm, Eric, and Terence Ranger, eds.  
 1983 *The Invention of Tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hohlfeldt, Antônio and Assis Hoffmann  
 1982 *O Gravador do Juruna*. (Juruna's tape-recorder.) Porto Alegre, Brazil: Mercado Aberto.
- Howard, Catherine  
 n.d. *Conservation and Conversion: Religion in the Rainforest*. Department of Anthropology, University of Chicago, unpublished manuscript.
- Ireland, Emilienne  
 1991 Neither Warriors Nor Victims, The Wauja Peacefully Organize to Defend Their Land. *Cultural Survival Quarterly* 15:54-60.
- Jackson, Jean  
 1989 Is There a Way to Talk about Making Culture without Making Enemies? *Dialectical Anthropology* 14:127-143.  
 1991 Being and Becoming an Indian in the Vaupés. In *Nation States and Indians in Latin America*. Greg Urban and Joel Sherzer, eds. Pp. 131-155. Austin: University of Texas Press.  
 1995 Culture, Genuine and Spurious: The Politics of Indianness in the Vaupés, Colombia. *American Ethnologist* 22:3-27.
- Keesing, Roger M.  
 1994 Theories of Culture Revisited. In *Assessing Cultural Anthropology*. Robert Borofsky, ed. Pp. 301-312. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Knauft, Bruce  
 1994 Pushing Anthropology Past the Posts-. *Critique of Anthropology* 14:117-152.
- Larson, Gary  
 1984 Far Side Cartoon. July 10. San Francisco: Chronicle Features.
- Linnekin, Jocelyn  
 1991 Cultural Invention and the Dilemma of Authenticity. *American Anthropologist* 93:446-448.



- López, Kevin Lee  
1994 Returning to the Fields. *Cultural Survival Quarterly* 18:29–32.
- Lutz, Catherine A., and Jane L. Collins  
1993 *Reading National Geographic*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- MacCannell, Dean  
1976 *The Tourist: A New View of the Leisure Class*. New York: Schocken Books.
- Mason, Alan  
1977 *Oronao Social Structure*. Ph.D. dissertation, University of California, Davis.
- Maybury-Lewis, David  
1991 Becoming Indian in Lowland South America. In *Nation States and Indians in Latin America*. Greg Urban and Joel Sherzer, eds. Pp. 207–235. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- McCallum, Cecília  
1995 The Veja Payakan. The Media, Modernism, and the Image of the Indian in Brazil. *CVA Newsletter* 2/94:2–8.
- Meireles, Denise Maldí  
1986 *O's Pakaas-Novos*. M.A. dissertation, Universidade de Brasília.
- Myers, Fred  
1991 Representing Culture: The Production of Discourse(s) on Aboriginal Acrylic Paintings. *Cultural Anthropology* 5:26–62.  
1994 Culture-Making: Performing Aboriginality at the Asia Society Gallery. *American Ethnologist* 21:679–699.
- Nelson, Diane M.  
1994 Rigoberta Menchu Jokes: Fashioning Identity on the Outskirts. *Anthropology Today* 10(6):3–6.
- Neves, Zanoni  
1994 Os índios na mídia. (Indians in the media.) *Boletim da Associação de Antropologia (Brazil)* 22:16.
- People Weekly  
1988 On a Three-Day Tour Break, Sting Goes Native—Very Native—To Meet a Chief Amazon Indian. *People Weekly* 29 (March 28):115–117.
- Pereira, Renato  
1989 Poder Kayapó. (Kayapó power.) *Ciência Hoje* 9:78–79.  
1990 Como os Índios se Travestam de Índios Para. . . . (How Indians Dress Up Like Indians for. . . .) Paper presented at International Conference on Nature and Communications, Milan, February 15–16.
- Polhemus, Ted  
1988 *Body Styles*. Luton, UK: Lennard Books.
- Posey, Darrell, and William Balée, eds.  
1989 *Resource Management in Amazonia: Indigenous and Folk Strategies*. New York: New York Botanical Garden.
- Potiguara, Eliane  
1992 Harvesting What We Plant. *Cultural Survival Quarterly* 16:46–48.
- Price, David  
1989 *Before the Bulldozer: The Nambiquara Indians and the World Bank*. Washington, DC: Seven Locks Press.
- Price, Sally  
1989 *Primitive Art in Civilized Places*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Ramos, Alcida Rita  
1988 Indian Voices: Contact Experienced and Expressed. In *Rethinking History and Myth: Indigenous South American Perspectives on the Past*. Jonathan D. Hill, ed. Pp. 214–234. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.  
1994a From Eden to Limbo: The Construction of Indigenism in Brazil. In *Social Construction of the Past: Representation as Power*. George Clement Bond and Angela Gilliam, eds. Pp. 74–88. New York: Routledge.  
1994b The Hyperreal Indian. *Critique of Anthropology* 14:153–171.
- Redford, Kent H.  
1990 The Ecologically Noble Savage. *Orion Nature Quarterly* 9(3):25–29.
- Redford, Kent H., and Christine Padoch, eds.  
1992 *Conservation of Neotropical Forests: Working from Traditional Resource Use*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Rich, Bruce  
1994 *Mortgaging the Earth: The World Bank, Environmental Impoverishment, and the Crisis of Development*. Boston: Beacon Press.
- Said, Edward  
1978 *Orientalism*. New York: Pantheon.
- Schwartzman, Stephan  
1991 Deforestation and Popular Resistance in Acre: From Local Social Movement to Global Network. *The Centennial Review* (Spring):397–422.

- Sillitoe, Paul  
 1993 Local Awareness of the Soil Environment in the Papua New Guinea Highlands. *In* *Environmentalism: The View From Anthropology*. Kay Milton, ed. Pp. 160–173. New York: Routledge.
- Simard, Jean-Jacques  
 1990 White Ghosts, Red Shadows: The Reduction of North-American Natives. *In* *The Invented Indian: Cultural Fictions and Government Policies*. James A. Clifton, ed. Pp. 333–369. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction.
- Smith, Geri  
 1989 Space Age Shamans: The Videotape. *Americas* 41(2):28–31.
- Sponsel, Leslie E., ed.  
 1995 *Indigenous Peoples and the Future of Amazonia*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press.
- Spitulnik, Debra  
 1993 Anthropology and Mass Media. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 22:293–315.
- Stocks, Anthony  
 1987 Resource Management in an Amazon Varzea Lake Ecosystem: The Cocamilla Case. *In* *The Question of the Commons: The Culture and Ecology of Communal Resources*. Bonnie J. McCay and James M. Acheson, eds. Pp. 108–120. Tucson: University of Arizona Press.
- Thomas, Nicolas  
 1992 The Inversion of Tradition. *American Ethnologist* 19:213–232.  
 1994 *Colonialism's Culture: Anthropology, Travel and Government*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Torgovnick, Marianna  
 1990 *Gone Primitive: Savage Intellectuals, Modern Lives*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Turner, Terence S.  
 1980 The Social Skin. *In* *Not Work Alone*. Jeremy Cherfas and Roger Lewin, eds. Pp. 113–140. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications.  
 1992a Defiant Images: The Kayapó Appropriation of Video. *Anthropology Today* 8(6):5–16.  
 1992b Representing, Resisting, Rethinking: Historical Transformations of Kayapó and Anthropological Consciousness. *In* *Colonial Situations*. George Stocking, ed. Pp. 285–313. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press.  
 1992c Symbolic Language of Bodily Adornment. *In* *Kaiapó Amazonia: The Art of Body Decoration*. Gustaf Verswijver, ed. Pp. 27–35. Royal Museum for Central Africa (Tervuren, Belgium). Ghent, Belgium: Snoeck-Ducaju and Zoon.  
 1993 The Role of Indigenous Peoples in the Environmental Crisis: The Example of the Kayapó of the Brazilian Amazon. *Perspectives in Biology and Medicine* 36:526–545.  
 1995 An Indigenous People's Struggle for Socially Equitable and Ecologically Sustainable Production: The Kayapó Revolt against Extractivism. *Journal of Latin American Anthropology* 1:98–121.
- Urban, Greg, and Joel Sherzer, eds.  
 1991 *Nation States and Indians in Latin America*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Van Cott, Donna Lee, ed.  
 1994 *Indigenous Peoples and Democracy in Latin America*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Veber, Hanne  
 1992 Why Indians Wear Clothes . . . : Managing Identity across Ethnic Boundaries. *Ethnos* 57(1–2):51–60.  
 1996 External Inducement and Non-Westernization in the Uses of the Ashéninka Cushma. *Journal of Material Culture* 1:155–182.
- Veja  
 1993 O fim do romantismo. (The End of Romanticism.) *Veja*, April 28:74–75.
- Viana, Francisco  
 1992 Índio gente fina: Os caciques brasileiros que enriqueceram explorando como bons capitalistas as riquezas de suas reservas. (High-class Indians: Brazilian chiefs who got rich exploiting the riches of their reserves like good capitalists.) *IstoÉ*, July 1:38–41.
- Vidal, Lux, and Gustaf Verswijver  
 1992 Body Painting among the Kayapó. *In* *Kaiapó Amazonia: The Art of Body Decoration*. Gustaf Verswijver, ed. Pp. 37–47. Royal Museum for Central Africa (Tervuren, Belgium). Ghent, Belgium: Snoeck-Ducaju and Zoon.
- Vilaça, Aparecida  
 1992 Comendo Como Gente: Formas do Canibalismo Wari'. (Eating like people: Forms of Wari' cannibalism.) Rio de Janeiro: Editora Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro (UFRJ).
- Viveiros de Castro, Eduardo  
 1992 Prefácio. (Preface.) *In* *Um Artificio Orgânico: Transição na Amazônia e Ambientalismo (1985–1990)*. (An organic artifice: Transition in Amazônia and environmentalism [1985–1990].) Ricardo Azambuja Arnt and Stephan Schwartzman, eds. Pp. 13–23. Rio de Janeiro: Rocco.
- Von Graeve, Bernard  
 1989 *The Pacaa Nova: Clash of Cultures on the Brazilian Frontier*. Peterborough, Canada: Broadview Press.
- Wagner, Roy  
 1975 *The Invention of Culture*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

- Warren, Kay B.  
1992 Transforming Memories and Histories: The Meanings of Ethnic Resurgence for Mayan Indians. *In* Americas: New Interpretive Essays. Alfred Stepan, ed. Pp. 189–219. New York: Oxford University Press.
- White, Richard, and Willian Cronon  
1988 Ecological Change and Indian-White Relations. *In* Handbook of North American Indians, 4: History of Indian-White Relations. Wilcomb E. Washington, ed. Pp. 417–429. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution.
- Whitemore, Hank  
1992 A Man Who Would Save the World. *Parade*, April 12:4–7.
- Wolf, Eric R.  
1982 Europe and the People without History. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Wright, Robin  
1988 Anthropological Presuppositions of Indigenous Advocacy. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 17:365–390.
- Zimmer, Carl  
1990 Tech in the Jungle. *Discover*, August 1990:42–45.

submitted April 3, 1995  
revised version submitted November 3, 1995  
accepted July 12, 1996